



## Expression of piRNA and Transposable Elements in *Drosophila* Ovarian Germline Stem Cells

Benjamin Story, Xing Ma, Kazue Ishihara, Hua Li, Kathryn Hall, Allison Peak, Perera Anoja, Jungeun Park, Jeff Haug, Marco Blanchette, and Ting Xie

**DOI: 10.26508/lsa.201800211**

*Corresponding author(s): Ting Xie, Stowers Institute for Medical Research*

---

### Review timeline:

---

Submission Date:	2018-10-09
Editorial Decision:	2018-11-08
Revision Received:	2019-05-22
Editorial Decision:	2019-07-01
Revision Received:	2019-10-01
Accepted:	2019-10-04

---

Scientific Editor: Andrea Leibfried

### Transaction Report:

(Note: With the exception of the correction of typographical or spelling errors that could be a source of ambiguity, letters and reports are not edited. The original formatting of letters and referee reports may not be reflected in this compilation.)

No Peer Review Process File is available with this article, as the authors have chosen not to make the review process public in this case.



1st Editorial Decision

08 November 2018

---

Re: Life Science Alliance manuscript #LSA-2018-00211

Dr. Ting Xie  
Stowers institute for medical research, Kansas City  
1000 E. 50th St.  
Kansas City, MO 64110

Dear Dr. Xie,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript entitled "Defining the Expression of piRNAs and Transposable Elements in *Drosophila* Ovarian Germline Stem Cells and Niche Cells". The manuscript has been evaluated by expert reviewers, whose reports are appended below.

As you will see, the reviewers are concerned about the validity of the data at this stage. They think that the piRNAs have not been sufficiently validated as being indeed piRNAs, and they think that some of your results indicate that the experimental set-up (cell sorting) doesn't exclude contamination.

We think that these technical issues currently preclude publication in Life Science Alliance, and although your manuscript is intriguing, we think that the points raised by the reviewers are more substantial than can be addressed in a typical revision period. If you wish to expedite publication of the current data, it may be best to pursue publication at another journal.

Given the interest in the topic, we would be open to resubmission to Life Science Alliance of a significantly revised manuscript that fully addresses the reviewers' concerns (except for further reaching functional insight, which would not be needed) and that is subject to further peer-review. Points 1, 2, 3 of reviewer #1 and major point of reviewer #3 would need to be addressed in a good way and we would need strong support from the reviewers for publication. If you would like to resubmit this work to Life Science



Alliance, please contact the journal office to discuss an appeal of this decision or you may submit an appeal directly through our manuscript submission system. Please note that priority and novelty would be reassessed at resubmission.

Regardless of how you choose to proceed, we hope that the comments below will prove constructive as your work progresses. We would be happy to discuss the reviewer comments further once you've had a chance to consider the points raised in this letter.

Thank you for thinking of Life Science Alliance as an appropriate place to publish your work.

Sincerely,

Andrea Leibfried, PhD  
Executive Editor  
Life Science Alliance  
Meyerhofstr. 1  
69117 Heidelberg, Germany  
t +49 6221 8891 502  
e [a.leibfried@life-science-alliance.org](mailto:a.leibfried@life-science-alliance.org)  
[www.life-science-alliance.org](http://www.life-science-alliance.org)

-----



RE: Life Science Alliance Manuscript #LSA-2018-00211R

Dr. Ting Xie  
Stowers Institute for Medical Research  
1000 E. 50th St.  
Kansas City, MO 64110

Dear Dr. Xie,

Thank you for submitting your revised manuscript entitled "Expression of piRNA and Transposable Elements in Drosophila Ovarian Germline Stem Cells". Two of the original reviewers re-assessed your work - original reviewer #1 declined to re-review it.

As already mentioned to you in a pre-decision consultation, it remains still unclear whether the resource value of your work is sufficient for publication here. As you will see below, reviewer #2 (who also assessed your response to original reviewer #1) points out that the description isn't comprehensive enough to allow others to use the data as a resource. Specifically, the reviewer points out that the piRNA profiles of your library and the previously published one should be shown in detail (positions and amounts) (point 4) and that the common and unique piRNA clusters in the different data sets should be shown (point 1).

You provided a preliminary response to the remaining concerns and we have discussed our decision in light of it, also with reviewer #2. We decided that a version that can more easily be used as a resource by others warrants publication here, and we would like to ask you to further revise your manuscript as you already outlined. Please see also reviewer #2's additional comments below to guide you through this final revision. Furthermore, the following editorial issues need to get addressed:



- please add a callout to figure S2G in the text
- please upload all figures (main and suppl) as individual files and without legends, the legends can remain in the main manuscript docx file
- please add a summary blurb in our submission system
- please link your profile in our submission system to your ORCID iD, you should have received an email with instructions on how to do so

To upload the final version of your manuscript, please log in to your account: <https://lsa.msubmit.net/cgi-bin/main.plex>  
You will be guided to complete the submission of your revised manuscript and to fill in all necessary information. Please get in touch in case you do not know or remember your login name.

To avoid unnecessary delays in the acceptance and publication of your paper, please read the following information carefully.

#### A. FINAL FILES:

These items are required for acceptance.

-- An editable version of the final text (.DOC or .DOCX) is needed for copyediting (no PDFs).

-- High-resolution figure, supplementary figure and video files uploaded as individual files: See our detailed guidelines for preparing your production-ready images, <http://www.life-science-alliance.org/authors>

-- Summary blurb (enter in submission system): A short text summarizing in a single sentence the study (max. 200 characters including spaces). This text is used in conjunction with the titles of papers, hence should be informative and complementary to the title. It should describe the context and significance of the findings for a general readership; it should be written in the present tense and refer to the work in the third person. Author names should not be mentioned.

#### B. MANUSCRIPT ORGANIZATION AND FORMATTING:

Full guidelines are available on our Instructions for Authors page, <http://www.life-science-alliance.org/authors>

We encourage our authors to provide original source data, particularly uncropped/-processed electrophoretic blots and spreadsheets for the main figures of the manuscript. If you would like to add source data, we would welcome one PDF/Excel-file per figure for this information. These files will be linked online as supplementary "Source Data" files.

**\*\*Submission of a paper that does not conform to Life Science Alliance guidelines will delay the acceptance of your manuscript.\*\***

**\*\*It is Life Science Alliance policy that if requested, original data images must be made available to the editors. Failure to provide original images upon request will result in unavoidable delays in publication. Please ensure that you have access to all original data images prior to final submission.\*\***



**\*\*The license to publish form must be signed before your manuscript can be sent to production. A link to the electronic license to publish form will be sent to the corresponding author only. Please take a moment to check your funder requirements.\*\***

**\*\*Reviews, decision letters, and point-by-point responses associated with peer-review at Life Science Alliance will be published online, alongside the manuscript. If you do want to opt out of having the reviewer reports and your point-by-point responses displayed, please let us know immediately.\*\***

Thank you for your attention to these final processing requirements. Please revise and format the manuscript and upload materials within 7 days.

Thank you for this interesting contribution, we look forward to publishing your paper in Life Science Alliance.

Sincerely,

Andrea Leibfried, PhD  
Executive Editor  
Life Science Alliance  
Meyerhofstr. 1  
69117 Heidelberg, Germany  
t +49 6221 8891 502  
e a.leibfried@life-science-alliance.org  
www.life-science-alliance.org



3<sup>rd</sup> Editorial Decision

04 October 2019

---

RE: Life Science Alliance Manuscript #LSA-2018-00211RR

Dr. Ting Xie  
Stowers Institute for Medical Research  
1000 E. 50th St.  
Kansas City, MO 64110

Dear Dr. Xie,

Thank you for submitting your Resource entitled "Expression of piRNA and Transposable Elements in Drosophila Ovarian Germline Stem Cells". We appreciate the introduced changes and that you made the piRNA data more accessible/available to the reader. It is thus a pleasure to let you know that your manuscript is now accepted for publication in Life Science Alliance. Congratulations on this interesting work.

The final published version of your manuscript will be deposited by us to PubMed Central upon online publication.

Your manuscript will now progress through copyediting and proofing. It is journal policy that authors provide original data upon request.

Reviews, decision letters, and point-by-point responses associated with peer-review at Life Science Alliance will be published online, alongside the manuscript. If you do want to opt out of having the reviewer reports and your point-by-point responses displayed, please let us know immediately.

**\*\*\*IMPORTANT:** If you will be unreachable at any time, please provide us with the email address of an alternate author. Failure to respond to routine queries may lead to unavoidable delays in publication.\*\*\*



Scheduling details will be available from our production department. You will receive proofs shortly before the publication date. Only essential corrections can be made at the proof stage so if there are any minor final changes you wish to make to the manuscript, please let the journal office know now.

**DISTRIBUTION OF MATERIALS:**

Authors are required to distribute freely any materials used in experiments published in Life Science Alliance. Authors are encouraged to deposit materials used in their studies to the appropriate repositories for distribution to researchers.

You can contact the journal office with any questions, [contact@life-science-alliance.org](mailto:contact@life-science-alliance.org)

Again, congratulations on a very nice paper. I hope you found the review process to be constructive and are pleased with how the manuscript was handled editorially. We look forward to future exciting submissions from your lab.

Sincerely,

Andrea Leibfried, PhD  
Executive Editor  
Life Science Alliance  
Meyershofstr. 1  
69117 Heidelberg, Germany  
t +49 6221 8891 502  
e [a.leibfried@life-science-alliance.org](mailto:a.leibfried@life-science-alliance.org)  
[www.life-science-alliance.org](http://www.life-science-alliance.org)